

**MINUTES
COLUMBUS PLAN COMMISSION MEETING
SEPTEMBER 8, 2010 AT 4:00 P.M.
COUNCIL CHAMBERS, CITY HALL
123 WASHINGTON STREET
COLUMBUS, INDIANA**

Members Present: Bryan Haza (President), Roger Lang, Tom Wetherald, Brian Russell, Steve Ruble, John Hatter, Ann DeVore, Dennis Crider, and Dave Bonnell.

Members Absent: Dave Fisher, Dick Gaynor and Tom Finke (Bartholomew County Liaison).

Staff Present: Jeff Bergman, Laura Thayer, Heather Pope, Sondra Bohn, Rae-Leigh Stark, Derek Naber, and Alan Whitted (Deputy City Attorney).

C/DP-10-04: BCSC Health Services Center – a request by Bartholomew Consolidated School Corporation for site development plan approval for a health services center. The property is located at 912 5th Street in the City of Columbus. ***(Continued due to improper notice.)***

Mr. Haza stated this request would be heard at the October 13, 2010 meeting.

CONSENT AGENDA

Minutes of the August 11, 2010 meeting (Approval and Signing).

C/MP-10-03: Jason Newton Minor Subdivision – A request by Jason Newton for a modification of Section 16.12.050 of the Subdivision Control Ordinance requiring that all minor subdivision plats meet the conditions of primary approval within 120 days. The property is located on the northwest corner of County Road 300 East and Sawin Drive in Columbus Township.

C/MP-10-07: Northern Village Lot 1 Replat Minor Subdivision – a request by Northern Village Associates to create 1 new lot for a total of 2 lots equaling ± 13.1 acres, and for approval of a modification from Section 16.24.060 of the Subdivision Control Ordinance which requires sidewalks or other pedestrian systems in all subdivisions except administrative and agricultural subdivisions. The property is located at 2985 North National Road in the City of Columbus.

Mr. Bergman presented the background information on the Consent Agenda.

Mr. Bergman stated the Jason Newton Minor Subdivision was approved subject to Mr. Newton relocating the existing drive that is on the property. He stated the Columbus City Engineer and the Bartholomew County Engineer have been in discussions where the location should be for the driveway. Mr. Bergman stated Mr. Newton is requesting an extension to meet the conditions of primary approval.

Mr. Bergman stated that the petitioner Northern Village Inc. is asking for a modification from

installing sidewalks or other pedestrian systems along 2985 National Road. He stated this is an area that is under construction due to the Highway U.S. 31 project and INDOT will be installing a sidewalk at that location in the near future.

Mr. Haza inquired if anyone in the audience was there to speak on these items.

There was no one to speak for or against these requests.

Motion: Ms. DeVore made a motion to approve the Consent Agenda. Mr. Lang seconded the motion and it carried unanimously by voice vote.

OLD BUSINESS REQUIRING COMMISSION ACTION

Mr. Wetherald left the meeting at this time due to a conflict of interest.

C/RZ-10-04: Grooms and Smith Rezoning – a request by Dwight and Linda Grooms and Mark and Carolyn Smith to rezone properties totaling 7.05 acres from I1 (Light Industrial) to CC (Community Commercial). The properties are located on the east side of County Road 220 East, between County Road 100 South and State Road 46, or more specifically, 4540 East State Street and 4475 East County Road 100 South, in Columbus Township.

Ms. Pope presented the background information on this request.

Mr. Dwight Grooms, Mr. Mark Smith and Mr. Mark Daugherty with Daugherty Design Plus represented the petitioners.

Mr. Daugherty stated that they agreed with the staff report. He stated that neither property owner was anticipating any structural changes to the building at this time. Mr. Daugherty stated that the rezoning is for Mr. Smith to be able to attract new clients to the existing building under the CC zoning. He stated they agreed with all the conditions.

Mr. Haza opened the meeting to the public.

There was no one to speak for or against this request.

Mr. Haza closed the meeting to the public.

Mr. Bergman stated staff would recommend sending a favorable recommendation to the City Council with conditions attached. He stated the petitioners have addressed most of the conditions. Mr. Bergman stated the subject properties will have access to public water and sewer and all landscaping required on the property should be restored in reasonable length of time. He stated the outdoor storage of signs, other material on the property shall be removed in a timely manner, and they have agreed to comply with all the conditions attached to the rezoning.

Motion: Mr. Ruble made a motion to send a favorable recommendation to the City Council with the exception of a change in condition (5) which would remove the references to “a change of use or structural expansion” and in condition (6), the date should be changed from October 1, 2010 to June 1, 2011. The following conditions are included as part of the Plan Commission recommendation:

1. Within 6 months of the effective date of the rezoning the applicants shall provide, via an administrative subdivision plat, a sewer easement (1) for a pump to be located at the south-west corner of County Road 220 East and State Road 46/State Street and (2) a common service line for all four commercial/industrial lots in this area. This service line portion of the easement shall extend along the entire County Road 220 East frontage of both properties included in this rezoning request. The easement(s) shall meet the specification of Columbus City Utilities.
2. The northwest corner of the property at 4475 East County Road 100 South (the portion of that property that is on the opposite side of County Rod 100 South) shall be rezoned to AP (Agriculture Preferred) as a part of the current rezoning request.
3. The applicants shall dedicate the planned right-of-way for County Roads 100 South and 220 East along all frontages of the subject properties, including the 4475 East County Road 100 South frontages on both sides of the road. Both roads are classified as "Local" by the Thoroughfare Plan and require a half right-of-way of 25 feet (measured from the roads centerline). This right-of-way dedication is to occur as part of the administrative subdivision referenced above.
4. A no-access reservation shall be platted along all frontages of both subject properties with the exception of (1) the small portion of 4475 East County Road 100 South located on the opposite side of the road from the bulk of the parcel and (2) a 50 foot area at the point of the shared lot line of the 2 subject properties on County Road 220 East. This 50-foot area shall be included in a shared access easement that is also 50 feet deep and shown on the administrative subdivision referenced above. In no way shall the presence of this easement be interpreted as limiting use of the existing drive from 4540 East State Street on to State Road 46/State Street until that property is redeveloped.
5. At the time either property is redeveloped the County Road 220 East and/or 100 South frontage of the lot shall be widened and otherwise improved (shoulders, etc.) consistent with the specifications of the Thoroughfare Plan in effect at that time (for a rural, local road if that remains the context of the area at the time the improvements are made.) No occupancy related to any redevelopment. shall occur until the required road improvements are complete.
6. All landscaping required on the property located at 4540 East State Street through prior conditional use case number C/CU-97-11 shall be restored to the property by June 1, 2011 No additional occupancy of the structure and/or property shall occur without the required landscaping being present.
7. The outdoor storage of signs and other materials on the property located at 4540 East State Street shall be made to comply with the requirements for such permanent outdoor storage in commercial zoning districts provided by the zoning ordinance. This shall be completed by June 1, 2011. No additional occupancy of the structure and/or property shall occur without the required fencing and landscaping being present.
8. The use of the property shall be limited to the following:
 - a. As permitted uses:

- Auto-oriented uses (large scale)
 - Auto Rental
 - Builders Supply Store
 - Equipment Rental
 - Sporting Goods
 - Pet Shop
 - Garden Shop (listed under retail uses)
 - Building finishes store (paint, carpet, wallpaper, etc.)
 - Repair Services (small appliances, jewelry, alterations, etc.)
- b. As conditional uses:
- Greenhouse/plant nursery
 - Contractor's office/workshop
 - Agricultural supply facility
 - Mini-warehouse/self-storage

Mr. Crider seconded the motion and it carried with a vote of 8-0.

Mr. Wetherald returned to the meeting.

C/MP-09-10: Creekside Park Office Minor Subdivision – a request by Columbus Parks Department to modify the condition(s) of approval for a minor subdivision (MI/P-09-10: Creekside Park Office). The property is located at 2320 & 2330 Midway Street in the City of Columbus.

Mr. Bergman presented the background information on this request.

Mr. Bergman stated that this was a Minor Subdivision request that was approved at the January 6, 2010 meeting by the Plan Commission. He stated the site is located at the corner of Midway and 23rd Streets. He stated this parcel was into two lots one of, which is the home of the North Star Montessori School.

Mr. Bergman stated that as part of the request they were required to install sidewalks along the street frontage of the new lot. After much discussion at the Plan Commission meeting it was resolved that given the conditions on 23rd Street, sidewalks would not be required, but instead they would be required on the frontage of both the new lot and the remaining tract along Midway Street.

Subsequent to the approval of the Creekside Park Office Minor Subdivision if became known to the Planning Department staff that (1) the owner of the Creekside property (Mr. Craig Fenneman) also owned the property to the immediate north of the site and that (2) the much sought-after re-routing of the Haw Creek People Trail involving a portion of the adjacent property was becoming more likely. Mr. Bergman stated that a re-routing of the trail to the east side of Haw Creek using a new pedestrian bridge to be located south of the 25th Street bridge is a Parks Department goal that was included in the City's recently adopted Bicycle & Pedestrian Plan.

Mr. Bergman stated that after some discussion with the property owner he stated they are willing to dedicate an easement for the People Trail on this property and would like that to be considered in lieu of the sidewalk that was required on Midway Street as meeting the intent of the Ordinance for pedestrian connections in that area.

Mr. Bergman stated that the reconsideration of the exchange is being presented by the Parks Department who is the applicant on this item. He stated the property owner is knowledgeable about the situation and is in agreement with the exchange.

Mr. Bergman stated the City would continue to hold the financial guarantee for the sidewalk construction until the Planning Department has possession of the copy of a recorded People Trail easement (suitable to the Parks Department).

Ms. DeVore left the meeting at this time.

Mr. Jamie Brinegar with the Parks Department represented the petitioners.

Mr. Brinegar stated the possibility of having a bridge to cross Haw Creek at this point was important for safety reasons on the People Trail. He stated this easement was very important for the rerouting of the trail on the site.

Mr. Russell stated from the Park Board's position and having personally walked the site, this is a good deal if it works out. He stated it would solve many safety concerns with the People Trail at this location.

Mr. Haza opened the meeting to the public.

Mr. Chris Price spoke in favor of this request.

Mr. Haza closed the meeting to the public.

Mr. Bergman stated that the Planning Department, City Engineer's Office, and Parks Department all support the suggested exchange.

Motion: Mr. Lang made a motion to amend the previous Subdivision (MP-09-10) such that the City Parks Department can accept the easement as noted on the property in lieu of a sidewalk along Midway Street and the legal transaction of the easement is in hand before releasing the financial guarantee that the City holds for the sidewalk. Mr. Bonnell seconded the motion and it carried with a vote of 8-0.

NEW BUSINESS REQUIRING COMMISSION ACTION

Mr. Wetherald and Mr. Lang left the meeting at this time due to a conflict of interest.

Ms. DeVore returned to the meeting.

C/RZ-10-06: United Way of Bartholomew County – a request by United Way of Bartholomew County to rezone a property of 1.77 acres from PUD (Planned United Development) to RM (Multi-family Residential). The property is located on the east side of Michigan Avenue between 13th and 14th Streets in the City of Columbus.

Ms. Thayer presented the background information on this request.

Mr. Peter Schwiegeraht with Miller-Valentine Group and Doug Otto, President of United Way

represented the petitioner.

Mr. Schwiegeraht stated this was a senior housing development and would be low-income housing. He stated to qualify you would have to be 55 years or older and a maximum of \$30,000 per year income.

Mr. Otto stated there is a need for affordable housing for senior citizens and low-income people in the City of Columbus. He stated United Way supported this request and the location of having senior housing close to those facilities of the United Way Center was certainly a plus for the senior citizens. Mr. Otto stated from a community point of view this is a great opportunity.

Ms. Schwiegeraht stated Miller-Valentine was a development company that has been in business for sixty years and has experience in all phases of developing properties. He stated they were a developer who is an owner and a manager as well.

Mr. Schwiegeraht stated that this project targets low-income senior citizens of \$30,000 per year income and under. Mr. Schwiegeraht stated that 40% of their residents come from owning a home, want an easier lifestyle, and find renting more affordable.

Mr. Schwiegeraht stated they are proposing 45 to 63 units and that will require a variance. He stated they would be applying to the Board of Zoning Appeals. He stated they would be developing a mix of one and two bedrooms units that are complete with all the modern amenities. He stated all units are 100% accessible to everyone. Mr. Schwiegeraht stated there would be an onsite manager who is there full time and a maintenance person for assistance for the residents. He stated there would be a club room, a theater room, fitness center and a business center that provides access to computers and fax and the whole building is wireless so they will have access to the internet.

Mr. Schwiegeraht stated that they are using the National Green Building Council standards and are making additional energy commitments when installing the appliances and lighting.

Mr. Schwiegeraht stated there is a demand for this type of housing in the community and this would be an ideal location for this development with the United Way Center being located nearby and would ask for a favorable recommendation of the rezoning request.

Mr. Ruble asks how Mr. Schwiegeraht sees the long-term market for this kind of housing. Mr. Schwiegeraht stated that the numbers that are being seen by his company indicate that the requirement for senior housing is increasing every day. He stated the increase would continue for decades and he would see this as a valuable alternative for affordable housing. Mr. Ruble asked if the market study was national or regionally based. Mr. Schwiegeraht stated that it was the primary market area, which is a three plus mile radius of Columbus, which would include around 6,000 households that would be eligible.

Mr. Haza stated that all the data that has been presented to the Plan Commission is promising, but the site is surrounded by industrial development on three sides. He asked how the demand for the housing would offset the fact this community housing is in an industrial area.

Mr. Schwiegeraht stated this was a transitional area for this location for housing. He stated

the site plan and the improvements proposed would be an important part of this project. He stated the upgrades that would be made to 13th, 14th and Michigan Avenue will bring those roads up to the city standards. He stated putting sidewalks on all of them would be an improvement to the area and they will try to do some on- street parking. He stated they would be creating a newer urban look for this housing development and that would be beneficial in the transitional period for the area. He stated landscaping and buffering would be an important part of this project.

Mr. Haza asked if he had a time in mind when it would be completed. Mr. Schwegeralt stated the day they start construction is the day when the marketing starts for the project. He stated there is a twelve to sixteen month construction process and in that, time there would be residents ready to move in. Mr. Haza expressed concern that the development was marketed properly, so the consumer would feel safe moving into an industrial area.

Ms. DeVore asked how the units would be different from the ones sitting vacant all over Columbus now. Mr. Schwiegeraht stated the units that are available for senior housing have waiting lists.

Mr. Bergman stated the question before the Plan Commission is whether the proposed zoning is appropriate for this site. He stated if the RM zoning for this site was approved it would remain with the property, regardless of the owner. Mr. Schwiegeraht stated they would be willing to put a condition on the rezoning if the project was turned down it would revert to the original rezoning.

Mr. Whitted asked if the existing PUD zoning would be appropriate for this development. Mr. Bergman stated that working within the existing PUD is a possibility, but the developer has a time line that has to be met. He stated this rezoning approval was related to the tax credit application and this had made revising the existing PUD not possible in terms of the timeline.

Mr. Whitted stated that making a recommendation for rezoning indicates that you have the control with that zoning and there could be reasonable conditions attached.

Much discussion was held on the rezoning and the conditions that could be placed on this property.

Mr. Haza stated it was his opinion that no restriction should be placed on this property if the rezoning was approved.

Mr. Russell stated that his company owned a warehouse in this area and he supports a multi-family project at this location. He stated it was his opinion that this would be a great transitional site into the current industrial zoning.

Ms. DeVore stated it was her opinion that she would prefer some restrictions attached to the rezoning if approved.

Mr. Bergman stated that the Plan Commission could attach any conditions that they deem appropriate to this rezoning.

Mr. Haza opened the meeting to the public.

Mr. Max Lemley spoke in favor of this request.

Mr. Chris Price stated he supported this rezoning request.

Mr. Bob (inaudible) a member of the United Way Board stated that the Board supported this request. He stated that they were all excited about the location of this senior housing project being so close to the United Way services that they provide.

Mr. Haza closed the meeting to the public.

Mr. Bergman asked if the general intent on 13th, 14th and Michigan in terms of road improvements would, this be on their side of each street. Mr. Schwergaralt stated they would work with the City Engineer to modify that section and provide on street parallel parking spaces beyond that typical section and would make improvement to the sides of the streets

Mr. Bergman stated there is a long list of reasons that this is a good infill project and is important to the community. Mr. Bergman stated that public notice was given to all the industrial sites and the Fire Department and there were no concerns from anyone. Mr. Bergman stated that staff would recommend sending a favorable recommendation to City Council and would recommend the following conditions: (1) The half of Michigan, 13th & 14th Streets adjacent to this property be improved to city standards as part of the development that would occur and (2) The development on this property follows the concept that was articulated by the exhibits that were provided, primarily as to the location and orientation of the building and parking on the site.

Motion: Mr. DeVore made a motion to send a favorable recommendation to the City Council with the following conditions: (1) The half of 13th, 14th, and Michigan Streets on which the property has frontage shall be improved to current City of Columbus standards at the time of any development of the subject property and, (2) Any development of the subject property shall follow the concept portrayed during the meeting. Mr. Russell seconded the motion and it carried with a vote of 7-0.

Mr. Lang returned to the meeting at this time.

C/PUDF-10-03: Sam's Club – a request by Sam's Club to amend a final PUD to allow the installation of new cart corrals, and the modification of the exterior color scheme. The property is located at 2715 Merchant's Mile in the City of Columbus.

Ms. Pope presented the background on this request.

Mr. Ryan Shrimplin with WD Partners represented the petitioners.

Mr. Shrimplin stated that all Sam's Clubs as part of a national wide store upgrade project are installing cart corrals that will be replacing the old ones. He is also asking for approval to replace the paint on the exterior of the builds. He stated this building is unique because of the architectural requirements that were approved by the Plan Commission in the Final PUD for this area.

Mr. Shrimplin stated that the color red was being replaced on the exterior part of the building by a new tan color.

Mr. Shrimplin stated that new proposed cart corrals are just replacing the existing ones. He stated the parking space count would not be affected. Mr. Shrimplin stated the corrals with covers would be more convenient for the customers as they would not have to pick up a wet cart when shopping.

Mr. Shrimplin stated that they would have metal posts that are set in concrete and the corrugated material would be attached to the posts. He stated these carts are similar to the one that are in place at the nearby Menards.

Mr. Lang asked if this was the standard for the leadership of Sam's Club. Mr. Shrimplin stated everything that has been proposed has gone through a review board on behalf of Sam's Club and this has been approved at the corporation level.

Mr. Lang asked if the dead landscaping that was part of the original Sam's Club approval would be replaced as a condition of approval. Mr. Shrimplin stated that they have a division that makes sure the properties are maintained to the standard that was approved.

Mr. Haza opened the meeting to the public.

There was no one to speak for or against this request.

Mr. Haza closed the meeting to the public.

Mr. Bergman stated this is routine practice when a site plan of this size is reviewed and there is landscaping that needs to be replaced. He stated he hoped this issue would be resolved. Mr. Bergman stated the Menards cart corrals have no approval from the Planning Department.

Mr. Bergman indicated that cart corrals proposed at this site should be looked at with the intent of the PUD.

Mr. Haza stated it was more of an issue at Menards.

Mr. Bonnell stated that it was his opinion that this proposal is not better than what exists now. He stated it was a step backward from where it was and the proposed cart corrals stand out when driving into the site. Mr. Bonnell stated the existing posts blends in and is more neutral than what is proposed.

Ms. DeVore stated it was for the convenience of the customers for the carts to be dry.

Mr. Lang asked if there were any specifications for designing cart corrals. Mr. Bergman stated no. He stated in the PUD there are some very general statements about quality design.

Ms. DeVore stated that Columbus, Indiana should be different by design and should have unique cart corrals.

Mr. Crider stated there has been much effort put into this PUD to make it different, such as hidden HVAC units, infrastructure, and they are proposing sixteen carports in the parking lot. Mr. Crider stated that it was his opinion that this does not follow the integrity of the PUD.

Mr. Lang stated that if this is what the corporation has proposed at all sites, it should be accepted here.

Mr. Ruble stated since this was a PUD and the PUD directs the Plan Commission to look at those types of things. He stated it would certainly be the responsibility of the Plan Commission members to give some guidance to insure the quality is there at this site.

Mr. Shrimpkins stated they would be willing to paint the metal roofs that would tie it into the building color.

Mr. Ruble stated that one of the things the members of the Plan Commission are required to look at is the building materials.

Mr. Bergman stated if it is the opinion of the Plan Commission that these cart corrals are not acceptable, staff would be willing to work with Sam's Club on an alternate design.

Ms. DeVore stated that the cart corrals at Menards should be addressed at some point.

Mr. Bonnell stated that it not just making the color match the the building, but more of a design issue.

Mr. Crider stated he would not be in favor of the cart corrals at this location if this were the only proposal they have. He stated there has been much debate about everything that was installed or constructed in the PUD and stated this was just as important as the other things the members have discussed.

Ms. DeVore stated it was her opinion that Sam's Club should present a different design to present to the Plan Commission for the cart corrals at this site. She stated it should fit in with Columbus "Different by Design" in that area.

Much discussion was held regarding the cart corrals.

Mr. Bergman stated staff would recommend a continuance to come up with a new design for the cart corrals and would recommend approval of the change in the request to modify the exterior color scheme to remove the exterior red paint and replace it with a tan color.

Motion: Mr. Bonnell made a motion to continue this request to the October, 2010 meeting in order to allow Sam's Club more time to provide them with a covered cart corral that is more in keeping with the intent of the Columbus Crossing PUD regarding "quality design" and approved the request to modify the exterior color scheme to remove the red on the building and replace it with tan. Ms. DeVore seconded the motion and it carried with a vote of 8-0.

DISCUSSION ITEMS

Mr. Bergman reminded the Plan Commission members of the Joint Plan Commission meeting October 20, 2010 at 6:30 in the Meeting Hall. He stated they would be discussing long range planning and the guest speaker would be Keith Reeves.

Mr. Ruble stated that he had given the City Council an update on the Thoroughfare Plan

process. He stated they are working at the staff level to make changes that came out of the August open house. He stated there would be another Open House session September 28, 2010 in the Meeting Hall from 8:00 a.m. to 7:00 p.m. He stated they would present the Thoroughfare Plan to the Plan Commission at the October 13, 2010 meeting.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT

LIASION REPORT

ADJOURNMENT: 6:30 p.m.

Bryan Haza, President

Steve T. Ruble, Secretary